



Worship Supplement 1969: The Vatican II of Lutheran Worship?

by Nancy Raabe

Lutheran Book of Worship (LBW; 1978)¹ ushered in a revolution in worship practices that we have long taken for granted. But who remembers its forebear, *Worship Supplement* (WS; 1969),² which began life as a successor to *The Lutheran Hymnal* (TLH; 1941)³ but ultimately laid the groundwork for LBW in landmark ways that have never been adequately recognized or appreciated?⁴

Move toward Unity

In the same spirit of opening-up that defined the Second Vatican Council (1963–69), the 1960s were years of great accomplishment in the move toward unity in the Lutheran church. The American Lutheran Church (ALC) had emerged in 1960 from Danish, Finnish, and German bodies. Two years later the Lutheran Church in America (LCA) brought together Danish, Finnish, German, and Swedish Lutheran groups. In 1967 The Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod (LCMS), previously not involved in the National Lutheran Council or the Lutheran World Federation, joined the ecumenical dialogues as part of the Lutheran Council in the U.S.A.

These were also good years for the Missouri Synod. It had been founded nearly 120 years earlier by Saxon and other German immigrants and saw steady growth through the first part of the 20th century as the Synod broadened its perspective and sought closer relations with other Lutheran church bodies. Baptized membership more than doubled between 1935 and 1965 to just under 2.8 million, placing it comfortably in the roster of mainline Protestant denominations.⁵

Following a series of broad-minded resolutions at the Missouri Synod's landmark 1965 convention in Detroit, LCMS president Oliver Harms issued an invitation to the other Lutheran bodies to join together to produce a set of worship resources that would be common to all. Representatives of the LCMS, ALC, LCA, and Evangelical Lutheran Church of Canada came together early in 1966 to draw up a statement of purpose. In February 1967 the Inter-Lutheran Commission on Worship (ILCW) began its work, with three representatives from each church body on its four working committees. A decade later LBW was published as the result of this cooperative venture,

although by that time the LCMS had withdrawn from the project and proceeded to prepare its own hymnal, published in 1982 as *Lutheran Worship*.⁶ The Missouri Synod's preparation of *Worship Supplement* was not directly related to the work of ILCW but emerged as the product of Missouri's long-term initiative to revise TLH. (More on the origin of WS below.) However, the fertilization of the work of the ILCW by this modest volume is unmistakable.

New Outlooks, New Resources

All this unfolded in the wake of the Second Vatican Council, which in 1963 had approved its Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, *Sacrosanctum Concilium*,⁷ by the astonishing vote of 2,147 to 4. In this landmark document, which returned the church to its ancient teaching, the council articulated the liturgy as an action of Christ and his body, the head and its members. In article 14 it affirmed that "Mother Church earnestly desires that all the faithful should be led to that fully conscious and active participation in liturgical celebrations which is demanded by the very nature of the liturgy," and noted that this participation is the "right and duty" of all the baptized. The Roman Catholic Church was at work on a new missal, and other mainline churches were also preparing new worship resources. It was an exciting time of new possibilities.

The public move toward cooperation between the LCMS and other Lutheran church bodies came with Resolution 13-01 at the Synod's 1965 Detroit Convention.⁸ In fact, the LCMS worship commission and the joint ALC-LCA Commission on the Liturgy and Hymnal, which had produced *Service Book and Hymnal* (SBH) in 1958,⁹ had begun working together toward similar ends as early as 1962. ALC and LCA representatives, in concert with Missouri's Walter Buszin, "made steady progress with their plans, which, by the time of the 1965 Convention, promised to foster serious liturgical scholarship, theological discussion, the development of shared Lutheran resources for worship, and an optimistic hope for even greater unity in the future."¹⁰

If not for other agendas which arose, this could have transitioned smoothly into the work of the ILCW.

Background of Worship Supplement

The Missouri Synod had already been contemplating a revision of TLH for several years. A report presented at the 1962 Cleveland convention indicated that the Commission on Worship, Liturgics, and Hymnology (CWLH) planned to finish its work by 1970 and expected the revision to "serve the church for an entire generation."¹¹ Walter Buszin was appointed editor and subcommittees were headed by Herbert Lindemann, Jaroslav Vajda, and Paul Bunjes.

In 1963 Lindemann suggested instead that they strive toward a pan-Lutheran worship book, but the members of the CWLH decided to proceed with the revision as first envisioned. A report on the revision's progress was made to the Detroit Synodical Convention in 1965, by which point a sizable part of the hymn revision had been completed. Although in Detroit the LCMS

resolved to pursue the cooperative venture that emerged as the ILCW over the course of the next two years, every indication is that the CWLH fully intended to continue its revision of TLH to conclusion, and that it did so continue. The vision [of] that project differed among the members of the CWLH, but it was apparently assumed that LC-MS work on TLH revision would contribute in some way to the work enjoined with other Lutherans.¹²

However, in a report to the ILCW early in 1966, Paul Bunjes presented a plan for an elaborate multivolume hymnal involving a pew edition and editions for organist, piano, and choir. This stood in direct contrast to Buszin's simpler, more straightforward vision. Carl Schalk recalls that it was not well received. "When he laid that out, there was no way all the other Lutherans were going to adopt a plan that had been cooked up by the Missouri Synod," Schalk reflected.¹³ Bunjes, seeing that his concept was going nowhere, eventually resigned from the ILCW.

Progress on the TLH revision continued nonetheless under the implicit understanding by committee members (several of whom also served on the ILCW) that cooperative efforts with other Lutherans would in some sense

grow out of its work, while at the same time contributing to the dialogue within the ILCW and broadening its scope. It was “intended to provide the congregations of the LCMS with some access to the fruits of its own worship commission’s liturgical and hymnological efforts, and thus to make additional worship resources available until such time as the expected pan-Lutheran materials would be published.”¹⁴

It was out of this complex of currents that *Worship Supplement* came into being. The introduction to the pew edition articulates the desire that it “serve as a modern experiment in applying timeless truths to timely needs” (9). Featuring settings of Holy Communion, Matins, Vespers, and 93 hymns, this modest volume arguably influenced the foundation and formation of LBW and the future of Lutheran worship through the present day in ways the participants probably never imagined.

Redefining Worship

To many of us completing the first decade with our fine, newly published hymnals, LBW is yesterday’s very old news. Nonetheless, it is worth recalling that many of the bracing characteristics of LBW that redefined worship for so many Lutherans in America were pioneered in *Worship Supplement*. Among these are:

- the use of unison song and chant in the liturgy;
- hymns drawn from a wide variety of sources as well as many newly composed. Ten tunes had never been used in a worship book before;
- newly composed liturgical music that featured strong melodic lines;
- the re-interpretation of the sermon hymn as the Hymn of the Day (WS actually says “Week,” but it went on to become “Day” in LBW) by recommending it be placed after the sermon instead of before;
- energetic, linear accompaniments for hymnody and liturgy, stimulating organists to effective and expressive leadership of the congregation. The prefatory notes to the accompaniment edition encourage keyboardists to pay attention to climactic moments in the liturgy and to provide “a sturdy and tonally rich support from the organ if they are to incite the worshippers to

exult; other portions may require a meditative or reflective mood or one of resignation: all such should find appropriate and fitting expression in the registrations and manner of performance on the organ” (6);

- the inclusion of the Old Testament lesson;
- expanded opportunities for lay participation in the service, including an assisting minister in the intercessions, and the presentation of bread and wine and monetary gifts during the Offertory canticle; the singing of this canticle as the gifts are brought forward;
- the inclusion of seasonal offertories;
- the use of eucharistic prayers (three options), which established a precedent for this practice in the LCMS long before it came to be questioned in connection with the critical review of materials for LBW;¹⁵
- the new composition of sung services for Matins and Vespers;
- an attitude of flexibility in the variety of liturgical options offered, reflective of the desire to meet the needs of a variety of worshipping communities;
- removal of bar lines and meters for hymns that did not originally have them;
- the restoration of authentic modal harmonies through the removal of unidiomatic leading tones;
- the crafting of strong, vibrant, linear hymn accompaniments in place of static vertical ones;
- the inclusion of two harmonizations for each hymn, one in a simple style for piano or organ and the other for organ only, featuring more complex polyphonic writing; and
- directions for standing and sitting (indicated by a silhouette figure in the margin), including the direction to stand for the Gospel reading. Standing during a doxological stanza of a hymn long had been common Lutheran practice, but now the directive was in print.

The preparation of WS was undertaken by members of the Music Committee of the LCMS Commission on Worship: Theodore Beck, Jan Bender, Paul Bunjes (chair), Richard Hillert, Edward Klammer, Herbert Neuchterlein, and Carl Schalk. The very fact that an accompaniment edition was published sets it

apart from Lutheran antecedents, since TLH and SBH had been issued as single volumes. The accompaniment edition included the first stanza only of hymns, keeping the page cleaner but necessitating the sensitive organist to play with the pew edition in view so the stanzas could be closely tracked.

Hymns

Sixty-seven of the ninety-three hymns in *Worship Supplement* found their way into LBW. Of these, a number were taken or adapted from SBH, but nearly half were unknown to either TLH or SBH—either newly composed or drawn from sources outside the immediate Lutheran tradition. Many are hymns that today we cannot imagine living without. These include:

- “With High Delight, Let Us Unite” (MIT FREUDEN ZART), in Martin Franzmann’s splendid translation.
- “God of Grace and God of Glory” (CWM RHONDDA). Where would we be without this hymn and Paul Manz’s concertato setting?
- “O Wondrous Type, O Vision Fair” (DEO GRACIAS). The text appeared in SBH to CONDITOR ALME SIDERUM and CAMERONIAN MIDNIGHT HYMN, but the inspired pairing with DEO GRACIAS positions it as a defining hymn for Transfiguration.
- “O Love, How Deep, How Broad, How High” (also DEO GRACIAS). Use the same harmonizations as “O Wondrous Type”? Never! Schalk has given us two more, brimming in vigor and internal rhythmic life.
- “Grant Peace, We Pray, in Mercy, Lord” (VERLIEH UNS FRIEDEN). This powerful prayer of Martin Luther’s, a recasting of a medieval antiphon paired with a tune originating in Nürnberg at about the same time, has become indispensable throughout the seasons of our worship life.
- “Sing, My Tongue, the Glorious Battle.” Newly set to Schalk’s FORTUNATUS NEW, this hymn makes for a perfect and unforgettable marriage of text and tune. In SBH the text is set to the characterless ST. THOMAS.
- “In Thee Is Gladness” (IN DIR IST FREUDE), in a sparkling harmonization by Jan Bender. This 16th-century gem alone is worth the price of the book, a newly restored treasure for all Lutherans to cherish.

- Elizabeth Cruciger’s “The Only Son from Heaven” (HERR CHRIST, DER EINIG GOTTS SOHN), a heartfelt hymn by a contemporary of Martin Luther and friend of Luther’s wife, Katherine von Bora, whose artistic legacy was cut short by her death at age 35.
- Martin Franzmann’s enduring “Thy Strong Word” (EBENEZER). Franzmann wrote the hymn in 1954 for Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, and based it on the seminary’s motto, “Anothen to Phos,” or “light from above.” (It is hard to imagine the text joined to any other tune, although my used copy of the WS pew edition contains this note: “Sing to Hyfrydol, #423.”)
- “Now the Silence” (Now), a Carl Schalk/Jaroslav Vajda collaboration undertaken specifically for WS that has transcended Lutheran circles to be beloved by congregations worldwide. It is worth noting that WS designates this as an “Entrance Hymn,” reflecting Schalk and Vajda’s original intent. Of contemporary hymnals, only *Lutheran Service Book* (LSB; 2006)¹⁶ observes this; most, like LBW and *Evangelical Lutheran Worship* (ELW; 2006),¹⁷ place it in the Holy Communion section.

An example of the care that was exercised over the hymnody in *Worship Supplement* may also be observed in “Let All Together Praise Our God” (LOBT GOTT, IHR CHRISTEN ALLZUGLEICH) and its earthy, warm-hearted new translation by F. Samuel Janzow of Nikolaus Herman’s text. Compare this new translation to the hymn as it appears in TLH with a translation by August Crull, “Praise God the Lord, Ye Sons of Men,” and we can appreciate what a work of grace Janzow has given us. We may observe the difference Janzow made in stanza 3 in particular. Here is Crull’s stanza 3:

He veils in flesh His pow’r divine
a servant’s form to take;
In want and lowliness must pine
Who heav’n and earth did make.

In Janzow’s hand this springs to life:
Within an earthborn form he hides
His all-creating light;
To serve us all he humbly cloaks
The splendor of his might.

Or compare the way in which “Of the Father’s Love Begotten” is allowed to breathe

in the unmetred realization in WS, pitched in the quietly glowing key of E-flat—with a lovely accompaniment by Bunjes featuring shimmering pedal-points—as opposed to the metered versions in TLH (4/4, in F major) and SBH (wrenched into triple meter in E major).

Notable among the 24 hymns culled from SBH which are indelibly written into our worship lives are “When Morning Gilds the Skies”; “Good Christian Men, Rejoice and Sing” (“Men” was changed to “Friends” in LBW); “Immortal, Invisible, God Only Wise” (transposed down a half-step in WS to G); “At the Lamb’s High Feast We Sing”; and “Let All Mortal Flesh Keep Silence.”

The transition from WS to LBW saw a significant winnowing of hymns as well. Some of the WS hymns that did not make the cut included William Watkins Reid Sr.’s “Forgive Us, Lord, for Shallow Thankfulness”; Horatius Bonar’s “Go Labor On”; Walter Buszin’s translation of Luther’s intricate “Lord God, Thy Praise We Sing,” also referred to as “Luther’s Te Deum”; and two Franzmann texts, “O Fearful Place, Where He Who Knows Our Heart” and “O Kingly Love,” both set to Richard Hillert’s tune *MISSION*.¹⁸

Liturgical Music

The enduring value of *Worship Supplement* where its liturgical music is concerned, in addition to the radical new approach of presenting it as chant and unison song, lies in the opportunities afforded its composers to test their ideas. We can deduce what they decided worked well and what didn’t by comparing WS with Hillert’s Setting One in LBW. “Dick tried out lots of things,” Schalk recalled of Hillert. “He really cut his teeth [in WS] on writing a setting of Holy Communion. Because of *Worship Supplement*, he knew a little better what worked and what didn’t.”¹⁹

WS offers three options for the *Kyrie*, included an expanded litany. We find the pattern and tone of the first option, by Paul Bunjes—if not the actual music—strongly reflected in the *Kyrie* of LBW’s Setting One, while Hillert’s own second option offers a more complex and less contemplative statement. It is in the stern complexities of Hillert’s attempt at the *Gloria* in WS, however, that we can picture how Hillert must have finally decided a completely different

approach to this hymn of praise was needed. The final result in LBW, “Lord God, heavenly king, almighty God and Father,” is upbeat and highly tuneful, a far cry from his earlier effort. Similarly, Hillert’s *Sanctus* in WS is gnarly and dour, set in the severe key of F minor. The “Holy, holy, holy” in LBW, in a bouncy F major, is a different story altogether.

On the other hand, Hillert’s contemplative offertory, “What shall I render to the Lord,” appears in LBW virtually unchanged from WS, but as an alternative to his more popular “Let the vineyards.” And we can hear the seeds of his gentle *Lamb of God* in LBW sown in the *Agnus Dei* in WS, a more lengthy excursion couched in modal tones but harboring the same prayerful aura of contemplative refuge.

In the setting of Matins we first encounter Hillert’s timeless setting of the *Venite* (“O Come, Let Us Sing”), which served worshipers so well through LBW. One regrets the removal in the LBW accompaniment edition of the occasional passing tones which keep the music moving forward. The editors of LBW chose well, however, in opting to replace Bunjes’ *Gloria Patri* in WS with one newly composed by Hillert. Likewise, Dale Wood’s incomparable *Benedictus* in LBW (“Blessed be the Lord, the God of Israel”) is a happy replacement for the rather tedious, monochromatic setting by Bunjes in WS. Nor does Bunjes’ setting of the *Magnificat* in the Vespers service in WS stand up to the splendid collaboration of Roger Petrich, David Schack, and Dale Wood that unfailingly makes LBW’s Evening Prayer such a welcome encounter.

One must inquire, however, whether the three nonliturgical Services of Prayer and Preaching in WS set a good precedent for a church body in which music of the liturgy plays such a central role. LBW’s Service of the Word similarly included no music. However, music was restored to this service in the Service of Word and Prayer in the 1995 supplement *With One Voice*²⁰ (“Salvation belongs to our God”; “Word of Life, Jesus Christ”; and especially the memorable offertory, “Glory to you, Lord, for yours is the earth”); in the Service of Prayer and Preaching in LSB, with its sung Old and New Testament canticles; and even more extensively in ELW, which also incorporates the *Kyrie* and *Gloria* from *With One Voice*’s Holy Communion Setting 5.

A Living Treasure

Worship Supplement is not simply a historical relic. The volume bears regular revisiting as a reminder of a period of excitement, renewal, and upheaval in the history of the Lutheran church in North America. Just like Vatican II, it opened up new worlds of music and liturgy in types and quantities that could not have been anticipated.

The real effects of both Vatican II and *Worship Supplement* would not be felt until a decade or more later, as the momentum and innovation of the two initiatives culminated in a broadening of the Roman Catholic worship experience and in a crown jewel of Lutheran worship and music in our age, *Lutheran Book of Worship*.

Worship Supplement also invites us into an encounter with the pioneering musical and liturgical minds who produced it, people who sought with all the gifts God gave them to give all Lutherans a fresh voice and a renewed life in song. It is a living book, welcoming us to new insights and ideas at every turn in the manner of all hymnals that are worthy of Christ.



Nancy Raabe is a church musician and composer who earned theology degrees at Trinity Lutheran Seminary. She has written three volumes of *One-Minute Devotions for the Church Musician* (St. Louis: MorningStar [2010–12]). Her newest book is the soon-to-be-published *Carl Schalk: A Life in Song* (St. Louis: Concordia [2013]). She lives in Milton, WI, with her husband, Bill.

Notes

- 1 Inter-Lutheran Commission on Worship (Minneapolis: Augsburg, and Philadelphia: Board of Publication).
- 2 Authorized by the Commission on Worship, The Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod and Synod of Evangelical Lutheran Churches (St. Louis: Concordia).
- 3 Authorized by the Synods Constituting the Evangelical Lutheran Synodical Conference of North America (St. Louis: Concordia).
- 4 I acknowledge with gratitude Randall K. Sensmeier's article, "The Influence of the *Worship Supplement* on the *Lutheran Book of Worship: A Legacy of Excellence*," *Church Music* (1979): 77–80, which provided helpful background material for this essay.
- 5 In 1935 baptized membership stood at 1,249,059, and rose to 2,788,241 by 1965 (*1965 Statistical Yearbook of The Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod*, p. 250). LCMS membership in 2011 was 2,231,858. My thanks to the Concordia Historical Institute at Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, for these figures.
- 6 Commission on Worship of The Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod (St. Louis: Concordia).
- 7 Available at http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_const_19631204_sacrosanctum-concilium_en.html (accessed June 10, 2013).
- 8 This called for the Missouri Synod, through its president and appointed representatives, to invite the other Lutheran churches to cooperate in the development of shared liturgical resources and a common core of hymns, so that all North American Lutherans would be able sing their body of hymnody as one voice (if not under one cover).
- 9 Minneapolis: Augsburg.
- 10 D. Richard Stuckwisch. "The Missouri Synod and the Inter-Lutheran Commission on Worship," *The Lutheran Forum* (Fall 2003), 45. Available at <http://estrada.cune.edu/FacWeb/Joseph.Herl/PDFs/StuckwischTheMissouriSynodAndTheLCW.pdf> (accessed June 10, 2013).
- 11 D. Richard Stuckwisch. "Truly Meet, Right and Salutory . . . or Not? The Revision of the Order of Holy Communion of the *Lutheran Book of Worship* in the Preparation and Development of *Lutheran Worship*" (Ph.D. diss., University of Notre Dame, 2002), 114, drawing from *Reports and Memorials of the 45th LCMS Convention* (St. Louis: Concordia, 1962), 305.
- 12 Stuckwisch. "Truly Meet," 117.
- 13 Conversation between the author and Carl Schalk, July 8, 2013.
- 14 Stuckwisch. "Truly Meet," 119, 129.
- 15 Stuckwisch. "Truly Meet," 131, referring to Paul Foelber. "Lutheran Book of Worship." *Concordia Journal*. 3 (May 1977): 107–9.
- 16 The Commission on Worship of The Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod (St. Louis: Concordia).
- 17 Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress.
- 18 The complete concordance of WS hymns in TLH, SBH, and LBW prepared by this author may be viewed at <http://www.nancyraabe.com/booksandpresentations.html>.
- 19 Conversation between the author and Carl Schalk, July 8, 2013.
- 20 Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress.